



California Public Utilities Commission

ULTS Administrative Committee Meeting

Please join the California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) for the Universal LifeLine Telephone Service Administrative Committee Meeting:

When: Monday, June 15, 2020 (1:00 – 4:00 p.m.)

Where: webex meeting

Call-In Number: 415.655.0002, participant code 963 598 475#

Agenda

1:00 – 1:05 p.m.	Introduction: Ken McEldowney, Chair
1:05 – 1:10 p.m.	Welcome: Commissioner Genevieve Shiroma
1:10 p.m.	Approval of Minutes: Committee reviews and approves the last meeting minutes prepared by the Communications Division (CD)
1:11 – 1:20 p.m.	Public Comments
1:20 – 1:30 p.m.	Fiscal Report: Lalaine Semana
1:30 – 2:00 p.m.	CAB Report: Carla Remigi <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Call Volume Statistics
2:00 - 3:00 p.m.	3rd Party Contract Reports: Coleen Duke <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Maximus<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ Enrollment Statistics○ Approval and Denial Statistics○ Call Center Statistics
3:00 – 3:15 p.m.	Legal Liaison: Sindy Yun

3:15 – 3:45 p.m.	<p>Communications Division Liaison Reports: Chari Worster</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Status of Proceedings: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Renewal Process Modification: Robert Sansone ○ Pilot Update: Caleb Jones ○ Status on Scoping Memo (Broadband) • Current and pending wireless carriers • Claim Status • Audit findings update: Judith Mason • Annual Notices • FCC – Lifeline – David Avila
3:45 – 3:55 p.m.	<p>ULTS-AC Report</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendations for CPUC staff
3:55 p.m.	<p>Review of Administrative Committee Vacancy Status</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nominate an alternate for co-chair • Nominate an alternate for large ILEC – Charlie Born
	Future Meeting Date
4:00 p.m.	Adjournment

Member Roster

1	Large ILEC	Primary Alternate	Michael Foreman	AT&T California
2	Small ILEC	Primary Alternate	Yvonne Wooster Lorrie Clark	Calaveras Telephone Company Sebastian
3	CLEC	Primary Alternate	Marcie Evans -----	Cox Communications
4	Wireless	Primary Alternate	David Avila Alex Gudkov	TracFone Wireless, Inc. TruConnect
5	Deaf/Hearing Impaired or Disabled Rep	Primary Alternate	Kate Woodford -----	Center for Accessible Technology
6	Consumer	Primary Alternate	Ken McEldowney -----	Consumer Action (Chair of Committee; will call in to the meeting)
7	Consumer	Primary Alternate	Vinhcent Le -----	Greenlining
8	CBO	Primary Alternate	Cesar Motts -----	Southeast Community Development Corp.
9	CBO	Primary Alternate	----- -----	
10	CBO	Primary Alternate	----- -----	
11	CPUC's Public Advocates Office	Primary Alternate	James Ahlstedt -----	Public Advocates Office

1. **Present:** Ken McEldowney, Charlie Born, Yvonne Wooster, Lorrie Clark, Marcie Evans, David Avila, Alex Gudkov, Kate Woodford, Mike Foreman, Vinhcent Le, James Ahlstedt, Caleb Jones, Joanna Perez-Green, Robert Sansone, Tina Lee, Judith Mason, Mary Rottman, Carla Remigi, Colleen Duke, Lelaine Semana, Leuwam Tesfai, Genevieve Shiroma, Sindy Yun, Terence Shia, Sarah Sharpe, Rick DiLollo
2. **Introduction**
 - a. Ken McEldowney gives a quick introduction as chair.
 - b. **List of personnel**
 - i. Commissioner Shiroma
 - ii. CPUC Staff
 - iii. Michael Forman, AT&T
 - iv. Center for Accessible Technology
 - v. Alex Gudkov, TruConnect
 - vi. James Ahlstedt, Public Adv. Office
 - vii. David Avila, TracFone
 - viii. Leuwam Tesfai, Advisor
 - ix. Terence Shia, Advisor
 - x. Maria Vasquez
 - xi. **Role Call of callers:**
 1. Kate Woodford Center for Accessible Technology
 2. Sindy Yun from Legal Division
 - c. **Commissioner Shiroma**
 - i. Suspension of renewal requirements
 - ii. Ruling issued June 8th extends suspension of renewal requirements through June 30th
3. **Approval of Minutes**
 - a. The minutes are approved unanimously.
4. **Public Comments**
 - a. No comments are made/received.
5. **Fiscal Report – Lalaine Semana**
 - a. Lalaine Semana presents the fund balance and answers questions regarding how it is broken out.
 - i. Are there safeguards in place regarding the \$300M loan if the fund is drawn too low?
 - ii. Commissioner Shiroma: Yes, we are working with the legislature and Department of Finance on that. It should be decided by tomorrow (June 16).
6. **CAB Report**
 - a. **Complaints have fallen overall during the last 3 months:**
 - b. **Alex Gudkov:**
 - i. **Have there been special complaints during COVID?**
 - ii. **Answer:** Not that we've experienced or had reported to us, but the TPA may have a different answer.
7. **3rd Party Contract Reports:**
 - a. **Colleen Duke:**
 - i. There has been a major decline in work over the last few months, due to COVID, but we expect an increase in work eventually. In the short-run, processing times have fallen and participation is up.
 - ii. Currently, there is a renewal freeze, and participation has risen to 1.7 million.
 - iii. There is a new slide on transfer frequency to address questions that have been raised by carriers. 690,834 subscribers (of 2,655,211 total) transferred at all. Of those who transferred at all, there

were 1.93 transfers per subscriber (mean). The most transfers for a single subscriber was 48. Overall, there were 0.5 transfers per subscriber (including those who did not transfer at all).

iv. Q&A:

1. Alex Gudkov: What do you expect will happen when volumes increase? How will you adjust?
2. Colleen: Right now, our priority is holding onto our experienced LifeLine employees, because we understand that this is temporary. We will be bringing new classes in to restore our workforce by the end of this summer to be adequately prepared.
3. Alex Gudkov: The transfers data is very helpful. Would it be possible to see a breakout of how many people transfer 1-10 times, 11-20, 21-30, 31-40, 41-50, 51+ perhaps? We are interested in ways of imposing a port freeze that would only block the outlying participants from abusing the system without harming the 90+% of people who are doing nothing of the sort. For instance, the previous port freeze rules allowed anyone to transfer repeatedly as long as they provided a reason of some kind for their transfer.
4. Commissioner Shiroma: We appreciate the request for additional data and want to be a data-driven program, but please be careful in referring to high-frequency transfers as abuse, because it is legal behavior. It is important, particularly in these times, that we keep administrative burdens low for participants and preserve consumer choice for low-income households.
5. David Avila: Do we give our California consumers the option to receive information via e-mail instead of direct mail?
6. Colleen: We do not.
7. David Avila: Is there a reason we do not? Has it been considered?
8. Colleen: We've discussed reducing the amount of paper, but I don't know that we've tried to make it an e-mail process. We've mostly focused on transforming it into a text-based system for wireless consumers.
9. Marcie Evans: I thought that was required by the GO.
10. Commissioner Shiroma: We will consider revisions to that and discuss it in greater detail with Staff from CD. Times have changed, and we should consider that revision.
11. Commissioner Shiroma: We've tried to inform CARE/FERA participants about LifeLine. Is it possible to know whether that drove any sign-ups?
12. Alex Gudkov: Can you tell us what website that link pointed participants to?

8. Legal Liaison – Cindy Yun

- a. Assembly Bill 3079 from Assemblymember Garcia has died in committee.
- b. There is a new bill 1058 that will reduce Federal subsidy level. Currently pending and set for hearing next month.
- c. Q&A:
 - i. Alex Gudkov: Is there a reason the Decision (which Decision?) is being delayed?
 - ii. Commissioner Shiroma: It's under deliberation, but we will update you as soon as we can.

9. Communications Division Liaison Reports

- a. **Chari Worster:**
 - i. April 13, Commission issued Scoping Memo and Ruling Priorities. Priorities include: appropriate levels of support, reexamining minimum service standards, conducting a program assessment, updating GO 153, improving renewal process, pending pilot proposals, temporary modifications related to COVID.

- ii. Schedule of priorities (from Scoping Ruling):
 1. April, PD issued addressing COVID
 2. June, PD issued addressing pending pilots
 3. Working Groups to revise GO153 will be formed / will convene this year.
 4. Working Group for Renewals formed 4th quarter of 2020 – 1st quarter of 2021, with Commission PD issued within 90 days.
 5. Program Assessment in 3rd Quarter of 2020, through 2nd quarter of 2021. Workshop on Program Assessment in 3rd quarter of 2021. PD in 4th Quarter.
 - iii. Renewals suspended until June 30th.
 1. June 8th adjusted proceeding schedule.
 2. Straw proposal to be issued in July.
 3. Ruling regarding SSA and MSS based on Staff Proposal by end of July.
 4. Pilot Proposals Ruling on Friday.
 - iv. We've been receiving calls from service providers regarding the Working Group.
 - v. Q&A:
 1. Alex Gudkov: Can you please repeat the timeline for the Working Groups?
 2. Chari Worster: Proposed revisions to GO153 will be presented in Q3, and then Commission will consider those revisions within 90 days (Q4->Q1)
- b. Robert Sansone:
- i. Are there questions or concerns regarding the processes proposed by the CPUC/FCC?
 1. Alex Gudkov: How is the Working Group formed? Do we simply create this in an ad-hoc fashion for anyone that wants to be a part of it? Or is there a more formal process?
 2. Robert and Chari: The Scoping Ruling is specific about the process; the 2018 working group comments should be included, so please read through it. It requires a balance of 3 categories for the Working Group – wireless, wireline, and consumer advocates. We also hope the Working Group will address all of the comments filed on the Workshop.
 3. Alex Gudkov: Great, thank you. That makes sense. Also, who should organize/initiate the creation of the Working Group? Is it the CPUC, or can I begin contacting parties to organize this?
 4. Commissioner Shiroma: Not every provider is present at this Committee Meeting, so we want to be sure that all providers of every category receives the same instructions from us regarding the formation of the Working Group, so we will not be doing that on an ad-hoc basis here at this meeting. We will provide additional information in the future.
 5. Chari: We spoke to the ALJ about this, and we will be discussing this further on the next Working Group call. Alex, if you want to lead that process, you may, but please read through the Scoping Ruling.
 6. Commissioner Shiroma:
- c. Caleb Jones:
- i. Questions:
 1. **When will the pilots be finished and is the information going to be disclosed**
 2. **What is the status of the budget? Commissioner Shiroma to coordinate with the Communications Group about information that should be made available.**
- d. Tina Lee: Claims update & approvals
- e. Judith Mason – Audit findings update:
- i. Internal problems resulting in overclaiming:

1. Failure to notify TPA of terminated/inactive subscribers and untimely removal of inactive subscribers.
 2. Failure to remove ineligible subscribers from WAR and submit documents for examination
 3. Failure to provide documentation breaking down administrative expenses
- ii. CPUC policies in response:
1. Issued demand letter with payment plan
 2. Followed up on internal control findings
 3. Compared providers' weighted average to TPA's WAR.
 4. Administrative costs are compared to previous claim, with follow-up requests for documentation as necessary.

f. David Avila – FCC Lifeline

10. FY 2019-2020 ULTS AC Budget

11. ULTS-AC Report

- a. Commissioner Shiroma would like CD to look into moving more of the renewals forms to email or text instead of mailing hard copies.

12. Review of AC Vacancy Status

- a. Administrative Committee will add Charlie Born to fill the vacant ILEC spot.
- b. Committee asked to consider adding World Institute on Disability (based in Oakland) as CBO.
- c. Commissioner Shiroma would like all members of the Administrative Committee to consider who else to add.

13. Future Meeting Date

- a. The next meeting will occur in September. We'd like to coordinate more with LIOB, but will probably not be able to marry the two in time for the next meeting.

14. Adjournment

- a. Meeting is adjourned at 3:48pm.